

Author:

Irhamdi Nasda

Affiliation:

West Aceh General Election
Supervisory Board

Corresponding author:

irhamdinasda@gmail.com

DOI:

10.32332/milrev.v2i1.6862

Dates:

Received 27 April, 2023

Revised 12 Mei, 2023

Accepted 29 June, 2023

Published 30 June, 2023

Copyright:

© 2023. Author/s

This work is licensed
under [Attribution-ShareAlike
4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)



Read Online:



Scan this QR code with
your mobile device or smart
phone to read online

COMPARISON OF THE CONCEPTS OF DEMOCRATIC AND SHURA SYSTEMS OF GOVERNMENT

Abstract: The concept of a system of government of Democracy and Shura is often debated. Opinions related to the Islamic system of government are interconnected with the democratic system arises because in Islamic government, there is a concept of shura which is considered the same as the concept of democracy. Shura is a constitutional principle in Islamic nomocracy because, at the time of the Prophet SAW, the application pattern varied, then in the development of Islamic government. At the same time, democracy can be interpreted as a government managed by the people in a society. The people are important as the source of sovereignty and power. In this study, researchers describe the similarities and differences between democratic and shura government systems. In this study, the author used library research data collection techniques. Based on the research that has been done, it can be concluded that the difference between democratic and shura government systems is the source of democracy. The voice of the people is the legitimacy of the voice of God. Whereas in Shura, God's voice must be the people's voice. The similarity of the concept of shura with the idea of democracy is that they both recognize and respect the right of each individual to express an opinion. Conversely, both have the principles of equality, freedom, and justice in deliberation.

Keywords: shura, democracy, government, system.

INTRODUCTION

Democracy and Shura are often considered to be the same system of government. But they were born from different worlds. Democracy comes from the Western world, which has historical roots and a worldview different from the Islamic world. Furthermore, some even hold the view that democracy has a substantial foundation that is different from

Islam. If Islam has its source in the Qur'an and the Sunnah of the Prophet, then democracy is purely the result of human thought.¹

The opportunity for study/discourse is discussed in the Qur'an under the term Shura (parliamentary framework, participating in deliberations in Indonesian). Muslim scholars have a wide range of opinions. Some argue that democracy and shura-based frameworks have values and similarities, while others say they are contradictory. Muslims agree that there are similarities and differences between the majority government and Shura.²

Shura is a joint of life in society and state used as a principle that must be upheld on earth. Shura is a principle that asserts that all power problems can be discussed. Regarding the way of deliberation, what needs to be formed is the institution of consideration. There must be a way of making decisions, implementing deliberative choices, and other aspects of governance, so a principle of deliberation is shari'a.³

Most Islamic religions in Indonesia have systems or rules for expressing opinions and the choice to communicate in good language about views in the media. The media is a channel or instrument to achieve the purpose of correspondence. Media is one of the communication aids for the community. Considering that voice-based systems require articulation opportunities and press opportunities.⁴

In this article, the author examines the concepts of democratic and Shura government systems; what is meant by comparison in this study is the similarities and differences between democratic and Shura government systems.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

¹ Aat Hidayat, "Syura Dan Demokrasi Dalam Perspektif Al-Quran", *Addin* 9, no 2 (2015): 401-20.

² Nilhakim Nilhakim, "Al-Sulthaniyah: Islam, Demokrasi Liberal Dan Sekularisme Oleh Nader Hashemi Dalam Kajian Hukum Islam Kontemporer", *ALSULTHANIYAH: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah* 1 (2021): 13-27.

³ Ahmad Sukardja, *Hukum Tata Negara dan Hukum Administrasi Negara Dalam Perspektif Fiqih Siyash* (Jakarta: Sinar Grafika, 2012).

⁴ Farida Rachmawati, "Media dan Demokrasi di Era Global: Studi Dakwah Islam Kontemporer di Indonesia", *Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities* 2, no 2 (2017): 157-73, <https://doi.org/10.21580/jish.22.2521>.

This type of approach is descriptive. Descriptive research is research that seeks to tell the solution of existing problems based on data. The type of qualitative descriptive research used in this study is intended to obtain information about the system of government, democracy and shura.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The starting point of democratic governance as a political framework can be traced back to about 100 BC. (S.M.) When the Greeks who established the polis (city-state) tried to answer this question. How the political establishment is structured to serve the interests of everyone and the government assistance of society.

Since then, democracy has been a political system that has experienced its ups and downs throughout human experience. Derived from the Latin *demos* (people) and *Kratos* (power), voice-based systems are always associated with the structure of the government of, by, and for the community or managed by the community. The idea of democracy as a type of government began with the contemplation of Greek logicians such as Socrates (399BC), Plato (429-347BC), and Aristotle (384-322BC). 342-271BC, Epicurus (342-271BC).

From the beginning to the turn of events today, the democratic system has been essential to human social problems, problems in elements, and stable changes. The understanding and practice of democratic governance evolve and conditions so that it can vary from place to place. Democracy is considered the best system of government.

The advantages and disadvantages of democratic governance in politics show that vote-based systems are growing relentlessly, firmly meeting the needs of the people who constantly crave the ideal quality of government. Furthermore, social demand political demand becomes one of the features of democratic governance as a governance arrangement and values that democracy is adaptable, general, and open to change.⁵

The Qur'an, as the holy book of Muslims and, at the same time, the leading guide in their lives, imposes a universal order of life, which includes ethical and moral values

⁵ M. Sirajuddin Fikri, "Makna Demokrasi Dalam Islam", n.d.

of social and national life. Although the Qur'an does not explain the problems of social and national life in detail, its principles and values, explicitly or implicitly, are found in Asia. These principles can be used as ethics and political morals of Muslims in the life of society and nation. Among the basic principles that exist in Siam al-Qur'an, which are also fundamental in the political order of Muslims, are the principles of tawhid, shura (deliberation, consultation), 'is (justice), *musawat* (together), Hurriyat (freedom) and Mahwah (brotherhood).⁶

Verse on musyawarah/shura found in the Qur'an (Q.S Ash-Shura [42]:38);

وَالَّذِينَ اسْتَجَابُوا لِرَبِّهِمْ وَأَقَامُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَأَمْرُهُمْ شُورَىٰ بَيْنَهُمْ وَمِمَّا رَزَقْنَاهُمْ يُنْفِقُونَ

Meaning: And those who have responded to their lord and established prayer and whose affair is [determined by] consultation among themselves, and from what We have provided them, they spend.⁷

From some of the translations above, the majority thinking and government is the command of Allah SWT in making common choices, and thinking is the ideal way to agree.

As for the statement of Allah SWT related to deliberation is found in Q.S Ali Imran[3]; 159:

فَبِمَا رَحْمَةٍ مِّنَ اللَّهِ لِنْتَ لَهُمْ وَلَوْ كُنْتَ فَظًّا غَلِيظَ الْقَلْبِ لَانْفَضُّوا مِنْ حَوْلِكَ فَاعْفُ عَنْهُمْ وَاسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُمْ وَشَاوِرْهُمْ فِي الْأَمْرِ فَإِذَا عَزَمْتَ فَتَوَكَّلْ عَلَى اللَّهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ يُحِبُّ الْمُتَوَكِّلِينَ

Meaning: So by mercy from Allah, [Muhammad], you were lenient with them. And if you had been rude [in speech] and harsh in heart, they would have disbanded from about you. So

⁶ Muhammad Fu'ad Abdul-Baqi, *Mu`jam al-mufahras li alfaz al-Qur'an al-Karim* (Dar al-fikr, 1981).

⁷ (Qur'an Kemenag, n.d.)

*pardon them and ask forgiveness for them and consult them in the matter. And when you have decided, then rely upon Allah. Indeed, Allah loves those who rely [upon Him].*⁸

Intentional in this regard, then aware of political, monetary, and get-togethers so that good thinking is done and all sound-based systems can offer viewpoints admirably and accurately.

Besides that in the statement of Allah SWT,(Q.S Al-Anfal[8]; 43):

إِذْ يُرِيكَهُمُ اللَّهُ فِي مَنَامِكَ قَلِيلًا وَلَوْ أَرَاكَهُمْ كَثِيرًا لَفَشَيْتُمْ وََلَنتَّارَ عَنْهُمْ فِي
الْأَمْرِ وَلَكِنَّ اللَّهَ سَلَّمَ إِنَّهُ عَلِيمٌ بِذَاتِ الصُّدُورِ

Meaning: [Remember,Muhammad], when Allah showed them to you in your dream as few; and if He had shown them to you as many, you [believers] would have lost courage and would have disputed in the matter [of whether to fight], but Allah saved [you from that]. Indeed, He is Knowing of that within the breasts.⁹

Consistency or rationality in translation can be interpreted as a firm attitude in its stance so as not to lean or be influenced to the side and continue to run in an orderly manner that is considered valid. Consistency is being steadfast and steady in doing what you want to achieve your ideal goals.¹⁰

Consistency in structuring shows that the individuals act controlled, severely, and straightforwardly. Furthermore, this disposition is required in the rule of the majority of government and thoughts prioritizing personal interests. However, what is advanced is the interest of the Ummah and the benefit of individuals or society.

Further in the word of Allah Almighty, (Q.S At Taubah [9]: 25):

لَقَدْ نَصَرَكُمُ اللَّهُ فِي مَوَاطِنَ كَثِيرَةٍ وَيَوْمَ حُنَيْنٍ إِذْ أَعْجَبَتْكُمْ كَثْرَتُكُمْ فَلَمْ
تُغْنِ عَنْكُمْ شَيْئًا وَضَاقَتْ عَلَيْكُمْ الْأَرْضُ بِمَا رَحُبَتْ ثُمَّ وَلَّيْتُم مُّدْبِرِينَ

⁸ (Qur'an Kemenag, n.d.)

⁹ (Qur'an Kemenag, n.d.)

¹⁰ Muhammad In'am Esha, "Kepemimpinan Di Era Demokrasi Deliberatif", n.d.

Meaning: Allah has already given you victory in many regions and [even] on the day of Hunayn, when your great number pleased you, but it did not avail you at all, and the earth was confining for you with its vastness; then you turned back, fleeing.¹¹

The Ummah had a lot of help from God in their battle against the polytheists who hindered the spread of Islam. Support appears as quick wins, sometimes, such as *Clash of Badr*, where they win an overwhelming victory, and *Skirmish of Hunain*, where they initially lose and then win. Also, whatever we do because of Allah SWT will be helped by Allah SWT.

The majority set governance and thinking apart from the just and steady nature, especially surrendering to Allah SWT, because the best help from Allah SWT and the best place to indulge is Allah SWT.

In addition to that, the statement of Allah SWT (Q.SAI-Hujurat[49]; 13):

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنَّا خَلَقْنَاكُمْ مِنْ ذَكَرٍ وَأُنْثَىٰ وَجَعَلْنَاكُمْ شُعُوبًا وَقَبَائِلَ لِتَعَارَفُوا ۗ
إِنَّ أَكْرَمَكُمْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ أَتْقَىٰكُمْ ۗ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلِيمٌ خَبِيرٌ

Meaning: O mankind, indeed We have created you from male and female and made you peoples and tribes that you may know one another. Indeed, the most noble of you in the sight of Allah is the most righteous of you. Indeed, Allah is Knowing and Acquainted.¹²

In terms of rules, everyone is equal before the law. The difference in needs between the two is due to the problem of strict obedience to God and His messengers. Thus, after restricting interference and offending others, Allah Subanakh Wa Tala advised them that they were equal people to the nobility.¹³

From the above understanding, *Shura* regulates the government and sees these considerations according to Islam regardless of identity, nobility, and skin color. In any case, it emphasizes that all individuals can offer their point of view fairly and openly as long as it is for long-term gain and does not separate between rich and poor, high difference, does not separate identities, and so on. But it focuses on community benefits.

¹¹ (Qur'an Kemenag, n.d.)

¹² (Qur'an Kemenag, n.d.)

¹³ Muhammad Ibrahim al Hifnawi, *Tafsir al Qurthubi* (Jakarta: Pustaka Azzam, n.d.).

Because everything according to Allah is the same, and there is no difference for Allah SWT.

So in the concept of shura, any problem that will be discussed in the shura assembly must first be directed to the basis and source of the ruling of the Qur'an and Sunnah. When there are no strong nas (the basis of the Qur'an and Sunnah), then the members of the shura assembly perform ijtihad to seek the ruling by comparing and researching the available verses and hadiths and adjusting and considering the matter being discussed and then qiyas with the existing ruling. Close to what is being talked about.¹⁴

Amin Rais proposed ten criteria so that a political system can be said to be a democracy, namely:¹⁵

- a. Participation in decision-making;
- b. Equality before the law;
- c. Fair distribution of income;
- d. Equal educational opportunities;
- e. The existence of four kinds of freedoms, namely freedom of expression, freedom of the press, freedom of assembly, and freedom of religion;
- f. Availability and disclosure of information;
- g. Need political manners;
- h. Individual freedom;
- i. The spirit of cooperation; and
- j. Right to protest

Democracy is made an option by many people based on three assumptions of thought, namely:¹⁶

¹⁴ Muhammad Ichsan, "Syura dan Demokrasi Perspektif Islam Dan Barat", *Substantia* 16, no 1 (2014): 1-12, <https://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id/index.php/substantia/article/view/4913>.

¹⁵ Toguan Rambe en Seva Mayasari, "Komparasi antara Konsep Syura dan Demokrasi dalam Politik Islam", *MUKADIMAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sejarah, dan Ilmu-ilmu Sosial* 5, no 1 (2021): 138-48, <https://doi.org/10.30743/mkd.v5i1.3313>.

¹⁶ Ihsan Nul Hakim, "Islam Dan Demokrasi: Studi Komparatif Antara Teori Politik Islam Dan Demokrasi Barat", no 1 (n.d.), <https://www.mendeley.com/viewer/?fileId=35887bcb-ee74-74e1-5020-b6f3787b0de3&documentId=6fcc7e43-1649-3e56-9fba-92393cc1100b>.

- a. Democracy is not only the final and best form of the system of government but also a noble political doctrine that will benefit most countries.
- b. Democracy as a political system and government is considered to have long historical roots (since ancient Greece). Hence, it is resilient and can guarantee the implementation of a stable political environment.
- c. Democracy is seen as the most natural and humane system.

Conceptually, democracy is a form or mechanism of a country's government system to realize people's sovereignty (citizen power) over the state to be run by the country's government. One of the pillars of democracy is the principle of trias politica which divides the state's political power into three parts, namely executive, judicial, and legislative. These three political powers of the state are manifested in three types of state institutions that are independent and in equal rank. The alignment and independence of these three types of state institutions are needed to supervise and control each other based on the principle of *checks and balances*.¹⁷

The differences between the democratic and *Shura* systems of government are summarized in the following table:

Table.1
 Differences between Democratic and *Shura* Government Systems

No.	Difference	
	Democracy	<i>Syura</i>
1.	Democracy can be defined as a group of people occupying a specific area, where each individual in it gathers because of the consciousness to live together. Among the factors that help the formation of the	Whereas in the Islamic system, the definition of Ummah is very different from what was mentioned earlier because in defining Ummah, Islam is not limited to factors of territorial unity, race, and language. However, Ummah in Islam has a

¹⁷ Hidayat, "Syura Dan Demokrasi Dalam Perspektif Al-Quran".

	Ummah is the unity of race and language. ¹⁸	broader definition because the Islamic creed becomes the binding rope between each Muslim without distinction of region, race, and language. Thus, although Muslims are diverse in race, language, and region, they are all one Ummah, one in the view of Islam.
2.	Realize various material goals to lift the nation's dignity regarding economy, politics, and military.	I realize all forms of community benefit without neglecting the spiritual aspect of <i>diniyah</i> .
3.	The people are in complete control of the government.	<i>Shura</i> , in Islamic government, is held and adhered to the law of Allah. People are not allowed to enact rules unless they follow Islamic law, which He has explained in the Qur'an and hadith.
4.	In a democracy, the authority of parliament is absolute. The law regulates its jurisdiction, but again the rule is vulnerable to change.	Majelis, <i>Shura</i> in Islam, is bound by the <i>nash-nash shari'a</i> and obedience to <i>waliyul amr</i> (ruler). <i>Shura</i> is limited to problems that do not have a <i>Nash</i> or issues that have a <i>Nash</i> , but the indications shown have some understanding. As for problems with clear <i>Nash</i>

¹⁸ Ahmad Muhammad Khalaf Al-Mumani, *Nizam al-hukm fil-Islam* (Dar Majdalawi For Publish, 2007).

		and legal signs, Shura is no longer necessary. <i>Shura</i> is only needed in determining the mechanism for implementing the nash-nash of Shari'a.
5.	Democracy is closely related to the existence of political parties, even though this is not in line with Islamic teachings because it fosters the spirit of division and groups.	Islamic Sharia has outlined the boundaries of Sharia that are fixed and must not be violated by the Shura Council. These limitations remain as long as Islam exists.
6.	Democracy is more concerned with solutions that embody majority votes, even if it investigates the truth.	Shura aims to produce a solution aligned with <i>al-haq</i> despite opposing the majority vote.

The similarity of the concept of shura with the idea of democracy is that both recognize and respect every individual's right to express opinions. In contrast, both also have the principles of equality, freedom, and justice in conducting deliberation.

Table.2

The advantages of the democratic and shura systems are as follows:

Democracy	More effective government and community participation.
	equality in voting.
	carry out supervision of the government
Syura	Making the best decisions is not based on the influence of majority votes or minority

	Fulfillment of rights, aspirations, from various parties.
	Limiting the dictatorial attitude of the ruler
	Forming a shared commitment

Shura and democracy value equality. This principle can be derived from Sura Al-Hujurat (49): 13, with the rule of ta'aruf (knowing each other), which shows theocentrism in Islam, which states unity as the beginning of human existence.

Although there are similarities between *Shura* and democracy, as stated by some. However, there is a very substantial difference between the two, considering that *Shura* is a method derived from Rabb al-basyar (human Rabb), namely Allah. At the same time, democracy is the fruit of the thinking of weak humans who cannot be separated from shortcomings.

Democracy by Islam contains democratic ideas and institutions based on the following principles or values:¹⁹

- a. The supreme and absolute power belongs to God. *Shura* is the basis of the principle of God's sovereignty and the supremacy of Shari'ah.
- b. The highest and most significant power in the Islamic state is the holy book of the Qur'an and Sunnah, whereas the power of the human is under the rule of God.
- c. Man on earth derives his power from the rule of God according to the concept of a caliphate.

Syûrâ, as the basic principle of the Muslim state and society, places the participation of the people in reaching decisions. This principle was used in the imâmah or bay'ah tracts in the past.²⁰ Such popular participation is often considered a theory of

¹⁹ Ichsan, "Syura dan Demokrasi Perspektif Islam Dan Barat".

²⁰ Mumtaz Ahmad, *State Politics and Islam* (American Trust Publications, 1986).

democracy, so democracy is understood as a form of elaboration of the system of syûrâ contained in the Book of Allâh.²¹

CONCLUSION

Law and order, the general public, political foundations, and a free and responsible press are implementations that support the improvement of the Shura-based system. We as citizens must take part in building a voice-based country. Moreover, as productive members of society, we must respond to this government with a positive activity, not political agitation, money-related approaches, and mistrust. Consequently, we must carefully encourage our political development and agree with every standard in a just life.

In the system of judgment and thought, one must cling to Allah because the opportunity of decision telling the truth, steady deliberation, and great will continue to be assisted by Allah SWT, some perspectives that we can take from the verses of the Qur'an above have examined how to organize His people in seeing the point of view of others to realize better what is good and right, and Islamic culture has the option to argue accurately and by facts. The Islamic system of government should reflect the interests of the Ummah or many individuals, not focus on individual interests.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmad Muhammad Khalaf Al-Mumani. *Nizam al-hukm fil-Islam*. Dar Majdalawi For Publish, 2007.

Esha, Muhammad In'am. "KEPEMIMPINAN DI ERA DEMOKRASI DELIBERATIF", n.d.

Fikri, M. Sirajuddin. "MAKNA DEMOKRASI DALAM ISLAM", n.d.

Hakim, Ihsan Nul. "Islam Dan Demokrasi: Studi Komparatif Antara Teori Politik Islam

²¹ Moh. Zahid, "Konsep Syûrâ Dalam Pandangan Fiqh Siyâsah", *AL-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial* 4, no 1 (2013): 17-30, <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-lhkam.v4i1.260>.

Dan Demokrasi Barat”, no 1 (n.d.).

<https://www.mendeley.com/viewer/?fileId=35887bcb-ee74-74e1-5020-b6f3787b0de3&documentId=6fcc7e43-1649-3e56-9fba-92393cc1100b>.

Hidayat, Aat. “Syura Dan Demokrasi Dalam Perspektif Al-Quran”. *Addin* 9, no 2 (2015): 401–20.

Ichsan, Muhammad. “Syura dan Demokrasi Perspektif Islam Dan Barat”. *Substantia* 16, no 1 (2014): 1–12. <https://jurnal.ar-raniry.ac.id/index.php/substantia/article/view/4913>.

Muhammad Fu’ad Abdul-Baqi. *Mu`jam al-mufahras li alfaz al-Qur’an al-Karim*. Dar al-fikr, 1981.

Muhammad Ibrahim al Hifnawi. *Tafsir al Qurthubi*. Jakarta: Pustaka Azzam, n.d.

Mumtaz Ahmad. *State Politics and Islam*. American Trust Publications, 1986.

Nilhakim, Nilhakim. “Al-Sulthaniyah: Islam, Demokrasi Liberal Dan Sekularisme Oleh Nader Hashemi Dalam Kajian Hukum Islam Kontemporer”. *ALSULTHANIYAH: Jurnal Ilmu Syariah* 1 (2021): 13–27.

Qur’an Kemenag, n.d. <https://quran.kemenag.go.id/>.

Rachmawati, Farida. “Media dan Demokrasi di Era Global: Studi Dakwah Islam Kontemporer di Indonesia”. *Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities* 2, no 2 (2017): 157–73. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jish.22.2521>.

Rambe, Toguan, en Seva Mayasari. “Komparasi antara Konsep Syura dan Demokrasi dalam Politik Islam”. *MUKADIMAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sejarah, dan Ilmu-ilmu Sosial* 5, no 1 (2021): 138–48. <https://doi.org/10.30743/mkd.v5i1.3313>.

Sukardja, Ahmad. *Hukum Tata Negara dan Hukum Administrasi Negara Dalam Perspektif Fiqih Siyasah*. Jakarta: Sinar Grafika, 2012.

Zahid, Moh. “Konsep Syûrâ Dalam Pandangan Fiqh Siyâsah”. *AL-IHKAM: Jurnal Hukum & Pranata Sosial* 4, no 1 (2013): 17–30. <https://doi.org/10.19105/al-lhkam.v4i1.260>.